

**Better Start Bradford Partnership Board Minutes
Thursday 22 March 2018
Mayfield Centre**

Meeting Started: 17.30

Meeting Ended: 19.30

Present:

Vipin Joshi	Community Board member (Chair)
Michael Jameson	Strategic Director of Children's Services, CBMDC
Sarah Hinton	Board Member, Bradford Trident (items 1 to 8 only)
Rosie McEachan	Programme Director, Born in Bradford
Ruth Hayward	Head of Commissioning (Women and Children), Bradford & Airedale CCGs
Michaela Howell	Programme Director, Better Start Bradford
Peter Horner	Voluntary Sector Representative, Bradford District Assembly
Talat Sajawal	Ward Councillor, CBMDC
Julia Elliot	Interim Head of Children's Services, BDCFT
Christy Bischoff	Community Board member
Gwen Balson	Community Board member
Nasreen Khan	Community Board member
Shaheen Khan	Community Board Member

In Attendance

Gill Thornton	Head of Programme, Better Start Bradford
Lizzie Hughes	Community Engagement Specialist, Better Start Bradford
Gill Hart	Funding Management (Investment), Big Lottery Fund
Shaista Ahmed	Finance Manager, Better Start Bradford
Guy Dove	Programme Administrator, Better Start Bradford

Apologies for Absence:

Kev Taylor	Shirley Brierley	Sarah Muckle	Nasim Qureshi
Rashida Latif	Jill Duffy		

1. Welcome, Introductions and Apologies

Vipin welcomed everyone to the meeting and noted the apologies.

Everyone introduced themselves to Lizzie, the new community engagement specialist, who is attending her first Partnership Board meeting.

2. Minutes of the Previous Meeting – 22 February 2018

The minutes were accepted as a true and accurate record.

3. Matters Arising actions table

Michaela confirmed the data administrator had resigned shortly after starting the role as it was not the job the person wanted. The post has been offered to another candidate.

Unfortunately following interviews, we did not recruit to the perinatal coordinator position. It has been re-advertised and, in the meantime, the Innovation Hub have arranged interim cover so it should not hold up the implementation of HAPPY.

Lessons Learned in Commissioning is on item 6 on the agenda and the Parents in the Lead sub-group will meet on 26 March.

Michaela said Guy had looked up the December 2016 minutes in response to a query from Nasreen. Alleygating is part of the Better Place project but we cannot spend anything extra on capital projects due to Big Lottery Fund requirements.

We will agree a revised date and time for the May meeting under Any Other Business.

4. Declarations of Interest

There were no new declarations of interest.

5. 'Getting to know you' session – Michael Jameson

Michael agreed to be recorded for this session.

Michael said his childhood was very happy but financially hard. He was one of six children and his father, a police inspector, left when Michael was eight years old. Michael was brought up by his mother who was a fantastic role model and that stays with him today. His mother had an Irish Catholic background and was one of ten children herself and the importance of the family was important to her and is to Michael too.

Michael's upbringing gave him self-belief and a sense of the importance of education and he noted he never went to pre-school although his five siblings did. Sport was a big part of his upbringing and he and his brothers played football until their late thirties. Michael went to sixth form and was influenced by a Catholic priest who said the world was bigger than Blackburn with Darwen and Michael went to Greece. His mother said he should do what he wanted and Michael had a gap year (as well as doing History at university) on which he lived on a kibbutz and went around the Middle East for nine months which taught him resilience and the ability to change. All of Michael's siblings went abroad but now live within a few miles of each other in Lancashire. He started in the private sector as a graduate trainee but realised it was not for him and moved into social work and has been in public service ever since.

Michael is married and has three teenage children and the sense of family runs through and his mother has 16 grandchildren who all live locally in Lancashire. Her influence gives him a sense of moral purpose, doing the right thing and making a difference. Bradford's Educational covenant is important, there is more out there than you see and there are a lot of humble people who do valuable things you do not know about.

The Partnership Board thanked Michael for his presentation.

6. Lessons Learned in Commissioning

Gill Thornton said the report included in the meeting papers summarised the independent review of our commissioning. Last year we did a lot of commissioning and used Embed who put in place a more streamlined process. We have now nearly finished our planned commissioning and this report sets out some discussion themes and suggested actions aimed at creating simpler, easier to access commissioning processes.

Gill said the initial Expression of Interest may not be reaching enough people and the time available to respond is too short in case an organisation needs to refer the matter to its Board before deciding whether to bid. Too many EOIs have been issued at once which has led to capacity issues for some organisations. We can mitigate these by improving the circulation list for EOIs, targeting groups we think may be interested, allowing more time, putting on information events and staggering the issue of EOIs.

Pre-qualification is a significant issue and the Commissioning Advisory Group have suggested the number of questions we ask should be cut down so we just ask for basic details and have no PQQ stage for contracts under £100,000. Also, we should not ask for a PQQ twice when an organisation has completed one for an earlier commissioning round. We could also offer to visit groups to carry out a financial 'health check.'

The Invitation to Tender also had too many questions. The suggestion is that we have no more than five questions, use less jargon and we have been providing too much information on the portal which may deter people. Other recommendations are that we hold workshops to go through the process, have a longer tender period, put forward one named contact for queries and increase the weighting for local groups.

Gill Thornton also said we should make the information we provide simpler, more accessible and provide 'top tips,' Q&As and examples like the BLF do. Gill mentioned many ways of better involving smaller local groups, including working with other support available such as CABAD to help them to be geared up for commissioning opportunities. We could also pay some costs of groups who work with us in service design.

The feedback was also that our commissioning should be more flexible and Gill said the Innovation Fund can be used for us to design projects together with local groups and formulate joint ideas for innovation.

Gill then asked for comments and for the Partnership Board to consider definitions of 'small' and 'local' for organisations bidding for our contracts. She explained we would update the commissioning framework which will then come back to the Board at a later stage.

Talat said the advertising and PQQ had given no suggestion that we would be checking an organisation's track record of delivery and he felt that people who had helped BSB prepare the tenders should be eliminated from bidding for them. Gill agreed that the questions should identify if the organisations have experience of delivery. No organisations who were involved in drawing up the service specification have bid but those who helped with service design may do so. Service design expertise may help with winning contracts but is not in the specification.

Vipin queried if we ask organisations to help with service design and Gill said this varies depending on the project and Forest Schools was a good example where a number of different people and organisations had been involved in service design. Talat said an organisation that had helped to write some bids had gone on to win the tenders which has disappointed small local organisations which feel overlooked. Michaela said the work of the organisation involved was available to all bidders so nobody was disadvantaged. We have revisited weightings to help local bidders but other factors were also scored. Gill said the organisation involved only wrote a manual for one of the projects and the other factors included having a good implementation plan and social value.

Michael asked if the learning that Gill had outlined makes us feel confident that it will stimulate local providers. A balance always has to be found between applying due diligence and favouring small, local organisations. Shaheen asked how small organisations could deliver district-wide and Michaela said they would only have to deliver in the BSB area but there were sometimes capacity issues.

Vipin said the consensus panels should have had 'small' and 'local' guidance to start with. Peter noted that there is not a single definition and these conversations go around a lot and the phrase 'locally rooted' is often used. National organisations can be very involved locally and the term 'local' is not necessarily easy to define, i.e. BSB-area or Bradford or West Yorkshire. Ruth suggested we should consider 'reach' in the BSB area and asked if 'local' means one element or all of the BSB area. Peter said for 'small' we could look at income figures and the NCVO have guidelines but their thresholds are national are therefore likely to be rather high for our purposes.

Michael questioned if we are trying to measure the right thing and the council consider social value with what they spend in the district and a measure might be the percentage of Bradford employees and volunteers. Nasreen observed that only four of the Board members present actually live in the BSB area but Gwen said that they could live outside it but be well aware of deprivation and other relevant issues and Michaela said this was why we structure the Partnership Board how we do. Nasreen said money should go to the BSB area and gave an example of a local community organisation who are doing a very good job of promoting breastfeeding but bidding for the Breastfeeding Support contract was beyond them. Talat said we should be awarding contracts to local organisations with established engagement with local people and locals know what works in their area. Talat also observed that Parents in the Lead is a step in the right direction.

Gwen said social value is important and that money is being spent in Bradford but we need to pay attention to the capacity of local organisations.

Christy asked if lessons had been learned from Better Place and Michaela confirmed that those lessons were what constituted this report.

Gill Thornton noted that Bradford Trident have suggestions about defining 'local organisations,' such as their base, employees and banking but Gwen said local banking does not prove that money is being spent in Bradford. Michael wondered if we have targets for the amount of local paid employees such as if 50 per cent of spend is here, 50 per cent of jobs should be here and said there are different ways of looking at it.

Gill Hart said, in response to a query from Michaela, that using small, local organisations is not as much of a discussion point at the other ABS sites. An organisation may not be local

but still has local employees and they have to be able to deliver the project and there needs to be a balance. Gwen remarked that sustainability is also important and Gill Hart agreed but the service needs paying for at the end of the ten years and she also agreed that local knowledge is important.

Decision: To adopt the revised commissioning framework.

Action: Michaela to circulate a draft statement explaining our approach to social value, including what 'small' and 'local' organisations are defined as, based on the discussions in this meeting.

7. Award of Contracts for Incredible Years and Breastfeeding Support

Gill Thornton said we have had clarification meetings with the two bidders for Incredible Years and decided to recommend appointing Barnardo's, who had originally come top in the scoring.

Talat noted that Incredible Years had not been delivered in Bradford before and there would need to be training in the area. He asked if we are contracting with Barnardo's as a cluster or as an organisation and Michaela said we are contracting with the organisation and Barnardo's staff (not necessarily cluster staff) will deliver Incredible Years. Nasreen asked how many other BSB contracts Barnardo's have been awarded and it was confirmed there is one (HAPPY).

Decision: To award the Incredible Years contract to Barnardo's.

Gill Thornton confirmed we received five tenders for Breastfeeding Support and the top two were again scored closely together. As no community Board members were involved in the panel, we would like to ask one of them to evaluate the five tenders then attend another consensus meeting. Currently there has been no community voice and BSB feel that voice is important. Christy said she is interested and agreed to evaluate the tenders and attend the second consensus meeting.

Decision: To delegate authority to the consensus panel to approve the award to a preferred provider for Breastfeeding Support to ensure a timely decision. This will be reported on at the April Partnership Board meeting.

8. Welcome to the World evaluation

Gill Thornton explained that Welcome to the World is a nine week antenatal course for parents designed by Family Links and delivery of it is part of the children's centres contract. BSB are just funding the monitoring and evaluation of Welcome to the World for a year which is now at an end. BSB and the children's centres have made considerable efforts to recruit and relationships between partners (the council, children's centres, Family Links) are good. No perinatal co-ordinator has been in post however and recruitment to Welcome to the World has been below target. Referrals from midwives not on the Opal team has been patchy, creche and interpreter provision had been needed but is up to the children's centres to provide it and getting data in a timely and useable form has been a challenge.

The Innovation Hub reported that after 12 months there is not enough data to evaluate the project. The target for recruitment was 200 women a year enrolled (attending at least one session) but only 86 were enrolled. Only 8 out of the intended 15 courses were delivered.

There are several reasons for this such as the restructure of children's centres two years ago taking time to settle down and the clusters crossing ward boundaries so not all the participants are from the BSB area. With the current review of prevention and early help we do not know if the children's centres will still deliver Welcome to the World from autumn 2018 onwards.

Rosie went through the progression criteria, the first being reach (engaging a representative number of families from the main ethnic groups in the wards) and is rated as 'Amber' for Pakistani and White British women and 'Red' for White Other women. Recruitment is the second progression criteria and is rated as Red and there is not enough data to determine if this was due to a recruitment or referral issue. The final progression criteria is implementation and this is also Red rated with only 8 of the 15 courses actually being delivered. Only 27 people completed before and after questionnaires which is too low for meaningful analysis. The Innovation Hub recommend we try to understand the reasons for struggling to recruit to and run courses and simplify data collection.

Gill Thornton outlined three options; the first one is to continue with the evaluation of Welcome to the World for six months and review again in September when we will know if the children's centres will continue to deliver it. The second option is to cease the evaluation and begin developing a different antenatal provision. The ABS Nottingham site has health visitors providing antenatal courses and Blackpool have Baby Steps as a universal project instead of targeted like ours. There is not much evidence of effectiveness and we would have to see if we could improve attendance at antenatal courses. The third option is to just signpost people to other provision such as at the BRI.

Nasreen asked how much Welcome to the World costs BSB and Gill Thornton confirmed it is £30,000 which is the cost of the monitoring and evaluation, plus staff time. Gwen said a fourth option could be to find out if there is a link between non-attendance and poverty. Peter observed that the possibility of children's centres ending delivery of Welcome to the World in six months' time is not our decision. Lizzie said that Welcome to the World has not worked anywhere in the district and the course is too long and some women have given birth before it ends.

Christy asked what the team doing the prevention and early help review are saying about Welcome to the World and Michaela said they are deciding which Family Links projects to continue from October. Rosie said we should not want to lose antenatal provision and Michaela remarked that once we lose community based antenatal support it will be difficult to re-establish. Talat said there are a number of issues such as cultural barriers (the fact that dads attend the course will put some local women off) and language. He noted Woodroyd children's centre had some success by offering incentives to pregnant mums. Michaela said this was interesting and noted we have been researching the use of baby boxes in that way.

Michael said he still did not understand 'local' in this context and that Welcome to the World needs more evidence. He said there will always be cultural barriers and going to antenatal courses at the BRI would be off-putting to some people and he asked what the national model was. If Welcome to the World is a universal offer then incentives may help but we should not overengineer this as we would end up none the wiser. Shaheen said she liked the Baby Buddy app and using that may make attending antenatal courses unnecessary. Rosie said there are a range of antenatal programmes out there nationally and we just need to know which to choose with recruitment being the issue.

Gill Thornton turned to the parents' survey which highlighted issues such as late referrals, not enough practical things being on the course, no midwives being present, the course being too long and/or at the wrong time of day, the lack of creche provision and interpreters and people wanting professional encouragement to attend. She mentioned HAPPY which has a TWICS (trial within a cohort study) evaluation and it is only ethical to do this if there is other antenatal provision available like Welcome to the World. Ruth queried the capacity at the hospital to cope with more referrals and Peter said the hospital provision is different and consists of one-off sessions and it is not actually an antenatal course.

Peter said he was not sure the options given are right and Michaela suggested we take the basis of Option 1 and we have until October before the children's services changes, so we should continue our support until then whilst talking to Family Links about adaptations. We have budgeted £12,000 for training and the data collection report. Rosie said we need to be tighter on the quality of the data collected and Michaela said she had recently met a children's centre cluster lead to express our concerns.

Decision: To continue with the evaluation of Welcome to the World for six months while adapting the project to try and improve recruitment.

9. Year 4 Budget

Shaista said that the anticipated spend for Year 4 is £5.9million of which £0.5million is leverage. She confirmed she looked at last year's costs with Michaela and Gill Thornton and has increased most of them slightly. Gill observed that Innovation Fund Projects are not agreed yet and £80,000 is our best estimate for them.

Decision: The Partnership Board notes and accepts the Year 4 Budget for 2018/19.

Michaela observed the budget had not yet been considered by the Finance and Audit sub-committee and she urged more community Board members to join it.

10. Programme Monthly Report

Michaela said the recruitment of new community Board members is underway and she asked all to help with this like Gwen and Shaheen have been doing. Gwen asked if the deadline could be extended and Michaela agreed 30 April.

23red have been appointed to work with the five ABS sites to develop a joint local campaign. They are visiting BSB on 27 March and more community Board members were asked to meet them from 10.30 to 11.30am to help to frame the campaign. Christy is attending and suggested asking Anna Boocock as well.

Gill Thornton mentioned that 13 dads attended the recent Audience with a Midwife event which was a success.

Ruth referred to one of the Opal Team recently winning a national award for Maternity Support Worker of the year and said this showed the benefits of a different way of working and should be a matter of celebration for us all. Vipin asked that congratulations be sent from the Partnership Board.

Nasreen mentioned the Dad's Talk event had been posted far too late on a local WhatsApp group. She also noted the events are on Fridays which is inconvenient for many in her community. Michaela said Friday is when the facilitator is available but she will feedback the points Nasreen has raised. Gill Thornton noted there was other, more timely publicity such as posters and using our social media.

11. Any other business

Michaela said the May 2018 Partnership Board clashes with the Bradford Trident Board meeting. After some discussion it was agreed to have the Partnership Board on the same day, Thursday 17 May, but in the morning, with a 9.30am start at the Mayfield Centre.

Guy noted that Mumtaz Elahi has resigned from the Partnership Board. Michaela said she has told Mumtaz we would be happy to welcome her back if she wanted to re-join at a later date. Vipin wished to record our thanks and appreciation for Mumtaz's contribution.

Finally Vipin asked if everyone had felt they had an opportunity to contribute to this meeting and all agreed that they had.

12. Date of next meeting

The next meeting is on Thursday 19 April 2018 at Killinghall Primary School, 399 Killinghall Rd, BD3 7JF starting at 9.30 am.

The meeting closed at 7.30 pm.